

# **Phylogenetic Relationships Between Eight African Species of Mormyriform Fish (Teleostei, Osteichthyes): Resolution of a Cryptic Species, and Reinstatement of** *Cyphomyrus* **Myers, 1960**

# F. H, VAN DER BANK\* and B. KRAMERt

\*Research Unit for Aquatic and Terrestrial Ecosystems, Rand Afrikaans University, P.O. Box 524, Auckland Park, 2006, Republic of South Africa; tZoologisches Institut der Universität, D-93040 Regensburg, Germany

Key Word Index--Mormyridae; Gymnamhidae; elephantfish; allozyme; isozyme; electric organ discharge; phylogeny.

Abstract--Phylogenetic relationships between seven elephantfish species from five genera (Mormyridae) that are endemic to southem Africa, and the Nile knifefish of the sister family, Gymnamhidae, were determined using biochemical genetic data, behaviour (the waveforms of the electric organ discharge), morphology, and habitat and food preferences. The results confirmed the existence of an undescribed species of *Hippopotamyrus,* and that *H. ansorgii* and *H. discorhynchus* are not congeners. These distinctions had been suggested by differences in electric organ discharge wavefonns and are here substantiated by morphological and genetic data. We recommend the reinstatement of *Cyphomyrus discorhynchus* (Peters, 1852). Genetic distance (D, Nei, 1972) values suggest Confamilial genera (D average of 1.09 for all species studied, and 0.715 for southern African species), with the exception of the sympatric and congeneric species: *H. ansorgii* and H. sp. (D=0.423). Phylogenies based on morphological and electrophoretic data are congruent. Copyright © 1998 Elsevier Science Ltd.

## Introduction

Fishes of the order Mormyriformes are endemic to Africa and include two families, the monotypic Gymnarchidae, and at least 188 species of Mormyridae (Gosse, 1984). Mormyridae have unusually large brains relative to body weight, comparable to that of humans (Fessard, 1958; Bell and Szabo, 1986). Mormyridae and *Gymnarchus* both use their electric sense for orientation, prey detection and communication, and are both electrogenic and electroreceptive (Lissmann, 1958; Szabo, 1961, 1967; reviews, Hopkins, 1986; Kramer, 1990, 1994; Moiler, 1995). Some mormyrids are popular with aquarists and serve as favourite bait for catching tigerfish *(Hydrocynus vittatus),* and some have been utilised to monitor changes in drinking water quality (Grove and Moiler, 1979; Geller, 1984; Kunze and Wetzstein, 1988; Kunze, 1989). Mormyrids can be trained by rewarding them with food whenever an appropriate action is executed after a previously recorded electric organ discharge is played back (Kramer, 1979; Graft and Kramer, 1992).

Electric organ discharge (EOD) waveforms are species-specific and may be used for species recognition. Kramer (in press) discusses electroreception and communication in fishes, and found distinct EOD differences between the species from the genus *Hippopotamyrus,* and also between two phenotypes of *H. ansorgii,*  which suggest that sympatric species exist for the latter. More species than are presently recognised might exist, and the systematic classification of these fish need review. The last major revision of the phylogenetic relationships of mormyrids was based on morphology and anatomy (Taverne, 1971a,b; 1972). The only

*(Received* 26 *April* 1995; *accepted* 31 *January* 1996)

previous study using allozyme data compared evolutionary relationships in West African mormyrids (Agnèse and Bigorne, 1992), and confirmed that electrophoretic studies can clarify evolutionary history and systematic relationships within the Mormyridae.

While allozyme data may provide insights into the interrelationships of higher taxa (above the species level), they should not be used to the exclusion of other information, i.e., data on anatomy, behaviour, development patterns, karyotypes, etc. (Shaklee and Whitt, 1981). The unstable nomenclature of some of the mormyrids inspired this multidisciplinary study of eight species which is based on a combined examination of 26 protein-coding loci, EOD waveforms, some food and habitat preferences, and morphological characters frequently used in identification keys.

## Materials and Methods

Seven mormyrid species (Table 1) were collected from the Upper Zambezi River near Katima Mulilo (17°29"S, 24°18"E) and identified using the key by Skelton (1993). The EOD waveforms were recorded in the field in the original stream water (conductivity, 86-92  $\mu$ S/cm at 17-24°C in September 1993; 55-70 µS/cm at 24.1-25.8°C in March 1994) immediately after their capture. A pair of low-impedance carbon electrodes oriented head-to-tail were connected to a differential preamplifier (1 Hz-100 kHz), and the output digitised (8 bit vertical resolution) using a digital storage oscilloscope (up to 10 MHz conversion rate) connected to a computer. EODs stored on disk were corrected to 25°C using a  $Q_{10}$  value of 1.5 (Kramer and Westby, 1985). Table 1 shows the sample sizes for EOD analysis.

Muscle and liver samples were stored in liquid nitrogen and transported to the laboratory. For small species, the whole fish was frozen (e.g. the dwarf stonebasher, *Pollimyrus castelnaul).* Morphological data **(Jubb, 1967;** Bell-Cross and Minshull, 1988; Skelton, 1993; Kramer, unpublished findings; Kramer *et al.,*  in prep.), EOD waveforms (Kramer, in press, and unpublished findings) and habitat and food preferences (Gilmore, 1979; Van der Waal, 1985; Heeg and Kok, 1988; Marraro and Winemiller, 1993) were used in combination with the electrophoretic data. Dorsal and anal fin rays, scale counts along the lateral line, and pericaudal scales were useful morphological characters to distinguish groups of mormyrids and to determine affinities. The morphological data was transformed to produce a cladogram by phylogenetic analysis using parsimony (PAUP, version 2.4, Swofford, 1985) as follows: a) dorsal fin rays more than 182 = 0 (species  $\#$ 1), 62-68 = 1 (species  $\#$ 2), 30-36 = 2 (species  $\#$ 3) and less than 27 = 3 (species  $\#$ 4-8); b) anal fin rays absent = 0 (species  $\#1$ ), 18-21 = 1 (species  $\#2$ ) and more than 21 = 2 (species  $\#3-$ 8); c) scales on the lateral line more than  $90 = 0$  (species  $\#1$ ), 80-90 = 1 (species  $\#2$ ), 46-75 = 2 (species  $\#3-6, 8$ ) and less than 41 = 3 (species  $\#7$ ); and caudal peduncle absent = 0 (species  $\#1$ ), scales around the caudal peduncle less than  $21 = 2$  (species  $\#3-8$ ) and  $22-26=2$  (species  $\#2$ ). Species are designated numerically (Table 1).

*Gymnarchus niloticus* from Nigeria was selected as an outgroup species. The precise geographical origin in Nigeria is unknown; all were less than 10 cm and obtained in one batch from a dealer near Frankfurt/ Main airport. This species was chosen since the phylogenatic relationships between the southern African mormyrid genera are not known. *Gymnarchus ni/oticus* differs from other mormyriforme by lacking ventral, anal, and tail fins, and by its peculiar mode of locomotion by its long, undulating dorsal fin.

Tissue extracts were prepared and analysed by starch gel electrophorasis as described in Van der Bank *et aL* (1992). Locus nomenclature (Table 2) followed Shaklee *etal.* (1990) and Dando (1974) for GPI. Loci were numbered beginning at the anodal end of the gel, and cathodally migrating allozymes were designated by a minus sign. The following buffer systems were used: HC-a continuous histidine, citrate buffer, pH 6.5, (Kephart, 1990); MF--a continuous Tris, boric acid, EDTA buffer, pH 8.6, (Markert and

<b>Species</b>	<b>Authority</b> Common name		n	
1 Gymnarchus niloticus	<b>Cuvier, 1829</b>	Nile knifefish	15 (30)	
2 Mormyrus lacerda	Castelnau, 1861	Western bottlenose	10 (10)	
3 Hippopotamyrus discorhynchus	(Peters, 1852)	Zambezi parrotfish	10 (8)	
4 Hippopotamyrus ansorgii	(Boulenger, 1905)	Slender stonebasher	2(4)(29)	
5 Hippopotamyrus sp.			9(14)(29;33)	
6 Marcusenius macrolepidotus	(Peters, 1852)	Bulldog	8 (85) (472; 303)	
7 Petrocephalus catostoma	(Günther, 1866)	Churchill	10 (37) (92; 133)	
8 Pollimyrus castelnaui	(Boulenger, 1911)	Dwarf stonebasher	10 (14)	

TABLE 1. SPECIES STUDIED, AUTHORITIES, COMMON NAMES, SAMPLE SIZES FOR ELECTROPHORETIC ANALYSIS AND SAMPLE SIZES FOR EOD ANALYSIS IN BRACKETS (SEX CONFIRMED BY HISTOLOGY OR GONAD INSPECTION)

Protein	Locus	<b>E.C. No.</b>	<b>Tissue</b>	<b>Buffer</b>
Adenylate kinase	AK	2.7.4.3	L.M	MF.P.HC
Alcohol dehydrogenase	<b>ADH</b>	1.1.1.1	Ł	MF.P
Aspartate aminotransferase	<b>mAAT</b>	2.6.1.1	L.M	MF
	<b>SAAT</b>		L,M	<b>MF</b>
Creatine kinase	CK-A	2.7.3.2	м	<b>MF.TC</b>
<b>Esterase</b>	<b>EST</b>	$3.1.1. -$	L,M	MF,HC,P
General protein	PROT-1,-2,-3		L,M	MF
Glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase	<b>GAPDH</b>	1.2.1.12	М	MF
Glycerol-3-phosphate dehydrogenase	G3PDH	1.1.1.8	L.M	MF.RW
Glucose-6-phosphate isomerase	<b>GPI-A</b>	3.5.1.9	м	MF
	GPI-B		L.M	MF
L-Lactate dehydrogenase	LDH-A	1.1.1.27	L,M	<b>RW</b>
	LDH-B		м	RW
Malate dehydrogenase	<b>sMDH</b>	1.1.1.37	L.M	P
Malic enzyme	sMEP	1.1.1.38	L.M	MF
Mannose-6-phosphate isomerase	<b>MPI</b>	5.3.1.8	L.M	<b>MF.TC</b>
Peptidase:		3.4		
Substrate: Glycyl-L-leucine	<b>PEPA</b>		L.M	MF
Leucyl-glycyl-glycine	<b>PEPB</b>		L.M	RW
Leucyl-tyrosine	PEP-LT1, -LT2, -LT3		L.M	MF
Peroxidase	<b>PER</b>	1.11.1.7	L.M	MF,P
Phosphoglucomutase	<b>PGM</b>	5.4.2.2	L.M	MF
Superoxide dismutase	sSOD	1.15.1.1	L.M	MF

TABLE 2. LOCUS ABBREVIATIONS, ENZYME COMMISSION NUMBERS (E.C. NO.), TISSUE AND BUFFERS GIVING THE BEST RESULTS ARE LISTED AFTER EACH PROTEIN. SEE MATERIAL AND METHODS FOR ABBREVIATIONS OF BUFFERS USED

 $L =$  liver,  $M =$  muscle.

Faulhaber, 1965); P-a discontinuous Tris, citric acid (gel 8.7), NaOH, boric acid (electrode pH 8.2) buffer (Poulik, 1957); RW-a discontinuous Tris, citric acid, (gel pH 8.7), lithium hydroxide, boric acid (electrode pH 8.0) buffer (Ridgway *et al.,* 1970); and TC--a continuous Tris, citric acid (pH 6.9) buffer system (Whitt, 1970).

Statistical analysis of allozyme data was executed using BIOSYS-1 (Swofford and Selander, 1981 ) and a computer program written by W.S. Grant (University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg). Genetic distances, D (Nei, 1972),  $D_{78}$  (Nei, 1978),  $D_{R}$  (Rogers, 1972) and  $D_{C}$  (the chord distance coefficient of Cavalli-Sforza and Edwards, 1967), were calculated. Nei's (Nei, 1972, 1978) nonmetric coefficients *measure biological properties, whereas* D<sub>R</sub> and D<sub>C</sub> have no biological premise and satisfy the triangle inequality. The latter matrix (D<sub>C</sub>) has the added advantage that it incorporates some realistic assumptions about the nature of evolutionary change in gene frequencies (Rogers, 1986). These genetic distances were used to produce phenograms generated by the unweightad pair group arithmetic average clustering method (UPGMA) of Sneath and Sokal (1973).

For the cladistic analysis, we followed recommendations of Mickevich and Mitter (1981, 1983) and Mickevich and Johnson (1976). The latter authors argued that the presence or absence of an allele is of more fundamental evolutionary importance than its frequency. We used this approach with the MIX procedure in PHYLIP (Felsenstein, 1993), with loci treated as characters and allele combinations as character-states. We used PAUP (Swofford, 1985) and a transformed data set, using the method of Green (1986), to construct a cladogram. FREQPARS (Swofford and Berlocher, 1987) was used to infer a parsimony tree directly from allelic frequencies, and FITCH (in PHYLIP, using D values) was used to produce cladograms. The cladogram produced by FREQPARS was scaled by the numbers of characterstate changes across loci, and CONSENSE (in PHYLIP) was used to produce a consensus tree. The different clustering methods were used to produce dendrograms because there is still some debate as to the best way to analyse this type of data (e.g. Sober, 1993; Hillis *et al.,* 1993).

### Results

Figure 1 depicts EOD waveforms for the mormyriform species studied. The outgroup, *G. niloticus,* was the only species with a "wave" discharge, that is, similar to a sine wave of constant frequency (depending on the individual, about 220-400 Hz). All other species of the sister family Mormyridae, generate "pulse" EODs of short duration, at irregular intervals and usually lower rates (see Kramer, 1990).





The EOD activity of the southern African mormyrids studied is in agreement with the general pattern of EOD activity established for western and central African species. However, the southern African species" EOD waveforms are distinct, and in some cases unique. For example, the EOD of *M. lacerda* was of exceptionally long duration, longer than any other mormyrid EOD known before. EOD duration of the other species was in a more conventional range, except in adult *I1/1. macro- /epidotus* males that had EODs up to nine times that of the average duration of females  $(N = 47)$ . This is the first clear case of EOD sexual dimorphism in a mormyrid (Kramer, in press, and unpublished findings). Although individual variation in EOD waveforms occurred, no qualitative differences were found within the species studied. Sexual dimorphism in *H. ansorgii* and *H*. sp. does not apply since in  $H$ , sp. fish from both sexes were present, as confirmed by gonad histology (Table 1 ).

The EODs of all mormyrids studied up to now (review Kramer, 1990) have little or no D.C. component, because positive potentials are balanced by negative ones, with the exception of *Mormyrus* species that all seem to have a more prominent head-negative EOD phase (also seen in *M. lacerda* of the present study, and M. *macrolepidotus* males (Kramer, unpublished findings)). Almost pure D.C. pulses like those generated by *H. ansorgii* and H. sp. of the present study were never seen in adult mormyrids before, although similar EODs are known from larvae of the West African species *Pollimyrus adspersus* (erroneously considered *isidori* by all or most members of the "electric fish community" (J.D. Crawford, pers. comm. 1995)) up to an age of about 60 days, when their distinct larval electric organ degenerates and the developing adult organ becomes functional (Kirschbaum, irschbaum, 1977; Westby and Kirschbaum, 1977, 1978; Postner and Kramer, 1995).

A tree (Fig. 4) produced using dorsal and anal fin rays, scale counts along the lateral line, and around the caudal peduncle shows that the clade containing species  $\#4-8$  (P. castelnaui, P. catostoma, H. ansorgii, H. sp. and M. macro-*/epidotus)* was separated from the monophyletic groups: *H. discorhynchus, M. lacerda* and the outgroup, respectively. Anatomical and morphological similarities between *P. castelnaui* and *P. catostoma* (Table 6) and between *H. ansorgii* and H. sp. are useful as quantitative characters to separate these groups, and *M. macro- /epidotus.* The latter species differs from the others in having a well-developed chin, and the only conspicuous morphological difference between *H. ansorgiiand*  H. sp. is the number of scales around the caudal peduncle  $(16 \text{ and } 20, \text{ response}$ tively; Kramer *et al.*, in prep.).

Locus abbreviations, enzyme commission numbers, tissues and buffers giving the best results are listed in Table 2 and electrophoretic data (relative mobilities of alleles and allele frequencies) are presented in Table 3. Figure 2 shows isozyme and allozyme differences between species. Allele frequencies conformed to expected Hardy-Weinberg proportions at all loci, with  $\chi^2$  < 3.841 (the critical value at P<0.05 and the smallest degrees of freedom). Several loci (guanine deaminase (E.C. 3.5.4.3), isocitrate dehydrogenase (E.C. 1.1.1.42) and L-iditol dehydrogenase (E.C. 1.1.1.1 4) sMDH-2 and PEPA-2) could not be scored satisfactorily in all samples. AIIozyme phenotypes of putative heterozygotes were congruent with those expected on the basis of the quaternary structure of the enzyme (Ward, 1977).

The mean number of alleles per locus ranged from 1-1.23 (with a maximum of four alleles at MPI in *P. castelnaui),* and the average percentage of polymorphic loci ranged from 0-23.08%. The average heterozygosity values per locus ranged from 0-8.3%. Genetic distances, D,  $D_{78}$  and  $D_{C}$  values (Table 4), and  $D_{R}$  values were also calculated from allele frequencies, based on information at all 26 protein

Locus	<b>Species</b>							
allele	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
АK								
100	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
<b>ADH</b>								
100	1.000						1.000	1.000
$-20$				1.000	1.000			
$-50$						1.000		
$-60$			1.000					
$-100$ <b>mAAT</b>		1.000						
$-105$	1.000							
$-100$		1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000		
$-95$							1.000	1.000
<b>SAAT</b>								
110	1.000							
100							1.000	
95 90		0.063		1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000
85		0.937	0.937 0.063					
CK-A								
103							1.000	
100		1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000
95	1.000							
EST								
110						1.000		
105 100	1.000			1.000				1.000
90			1.000		1.000		1.000	
85		0.571						
80		0.429						
<b>GAPDH</b>								
110	1.000							
100		1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
G3PDH								
110 105		1.000			1.000			
100			1.000	1.000		1.000	1.000	1.000
90	1.000							
GPI-A								
105								1.000
100	1.000	1.000		1.000				
95			0.937		1.000	1.000		
92 90			0.063				1.000	
GPI-B								
110						1.000		
100		1.000	0.750		1.000		1.000	1.000
90			0.250	1.000				
LDH-A								
105							1.000	
100 95	1.000							
LDH-B		1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000
105			1.000				1.000	1.000
100		1.000		1.000	1.000	1.000		
90	1.000							
sMDH								
120							0.714	
110 100	0.909							
	0.091	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.286	1.000

TABLE 3. ALLELE FREQUENCIES AND RELATIVE MOBILITIES OF ALLELE PRODUCTS DETECTED AT 26 PROTEIN CODING LOCI IN EIGHT MORMYRIFORM SPECIES DESIGNATED NUMERICALLY (TABLE 1)

Locus				<b>Species</b>				
aliele	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
sMEP								
102		1.000						
100	1.000							
95				1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
92			1.000					
MPI								
105 102	1.000	1.000	0.056 0.944		1.000	1.000		0.125
100				0.500				0.312
95				0.500			1.000	0.500
90								0.063
PEPA								
105	1.000							
100		1.000				1.000		
95			1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000	1.000
<b>PEPB</b>								
105							1.000	
100		1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000
95	1.000							
PEP-LT1								
100		1.000	1.000				1.000	
90				1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000
PEP-LT2		1.000						
100 97	1.000					1.000		
95			0.250	0.250	0.250			
90			0.750	0.750	0.750		1.000	1.000
PEP-LT3								
110		1.000						
100	1.000							
95			1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
<b>PER</b>								
120	1.000							
115						1.000		
100		1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000	1.000
<b>PGM</b>								
105			1.000	1.000		1.000		0.500
100		1.000					1.000	0.500
95	1.000							
90					1.000			
PROT-1							1.000	1.000
105				1.000				
100 90	1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000	1.000		
PROT-2								
105				1.000				
100		1.000	1.000			1.000	1.000	
98								1.000
95					1.000			
PROT-3								
103							1.000	
100		1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000		1.000
90	1.000							
sSOD								
120		1.000	0.750					
110		0.250			1.000	1.000	1.000	
105				1.000				
90	1.000		1.000					

TAB LE 3. *--CONTINUED* 



FIG, 2. ZYMOGRAMS EXHIBITING MOBILITY DIFFERENCES OF ALLELES AT THE FOLLOWING LOCI: a) GLYCEROL-3- PHOSPHATE DEHYDROGENASE (G3PDH), b) GLUCOSE-6-PHOSPHATE ISOMERASE (GPI-A, -B), AND c) PHOS-PHOGLUCO-MUTASE (PGM). **Four individuals each of the hitherto recognised mormyriform species studied ere compared, Species are designated numerically (Table** 1).





**coding loci (Table 3). The values of D and D7a are essentially the same. However,**  it is not possible to calculate D<sub>78</sub> values for species where isozymes were not **detected (e.g. the outgroup). D values are discussed in order to compare results obtained by other authors for conspecific populations, congeneric species and confamilial genera. These values ranged from 0.423-2.470 and from 0.530-0.860**  for  $D<sub>C</sub>$  between species (Table 4). The smallest values for both indices were



FIG. 3. DENDROGRAMS USING ALLELE FREQUENCY DATA FOR EIGHT MORMYRIFORM SPECIES (DESIGNATED NUMERICALLY IN TABLE 1) PRODUCED BY: a) UPGMA AND D VALUES; b) FITCH; c) MIX; d) PAUP; e) FREQPARS; AND f) CONSENSE (THE VALUES AT EACH FORK INDICATE THE PERCENTAGE RESOLUTION OF THE GROUP, WHICH CONSISTS OF THE SPECIES TO THE RIGHT FROM THE FORK).

between H. ansorgii and H. sp., and the largest values were obtained between the outgroup (G. niloticus) and the other species from southern Africa (Table 4).

The phenogram constructed using D values (Table 4) is shown in Fig. 3a. Similar phenetic relationships were produced with  $D_{78}$ ,  $D_R$  and  $D_C$  compared to those presented in Fig. 3a using UPGMA. Figures 3b-e depict cladistic relationships among the species studied using FITCH, MIX, PAUP and FREQPARS, respectively. A consistency index of 69% was obtained when character-states (Table 5) were used to produce Fig. 3d. A cladogram (Fig. 3f) produced from the data generated in Figs 3a-e,  $D_R$  and  $D_C$  values grouped: H. ansorgii with H. sp., P. catostoma with P. castelnaui, and M. lacerda with H. dis-





*corhynchus.* **Weak affinities occurred between the former group and** *M. macrolepidotus,* **and between this group (Fig. 3f) and the group containing** *M. lacerda*  **and** *H. discorhynchus* **(14%).** *Hippopotamyrus discorhynchus* **was constantly separated from the other two H. species (Figs 3a-f). Figure 4 presents a summary of relationships based on characters obtained from this study, and additional data from other sources (Table 6).** 

## **Discussion**

**The waveforms of electric organ discharge are species-specific, and the different EODs (Fig. 1 ) observed can show relatedness. For example, the bipolar waveform obtained for** *H. discorhynchus* **is in contrast with the monopolar EODs obtained for the other two H. species. This suggests that they do not belong to the same genus.**  It is also evident that a sympatric species of *H. ansorgii* exists. Other **EOD** differ**ences (to identify groups and/or individual species) are summarised in Table 6. The number of pericaudal scales in** *H. ansorgii* **is 16 (Bell-Cross and Minshull, 1988; confirmed by P. Skelton in type material, pers. comm.) and 20 in** *H***. sp. (Kramer** *et a/.,* **in prep.; N= 16), and the EOD of the former species is shorter than 0.5 ms at 10% of the peak amplitude, compared to longer than 1.0 ms in** *H***, sp. (Fig. 1). Other distinct differences between species are allele products that migrated faster at the EST, PROT-1, -2, GPI-A and PGM, and slower at the** 



FIG. 4. CLADOGRAM PRODUCED FROM GENETIC, BEHAVIOURAL AND MORPHOLOGICAL DATA (NUMBERS NEXT TO SPECIES REFERS TO TABLE 1, AND PLOTTED ON THE TOPOLOGY REFER TO CHARACTERS LISTED IN TABLE 6).

**G3PDH,** GPI-B, MPI and sSOD protein-coding loci in *H. ansorgiisamples* (Fig. 2, Table 3) compared to those of H. sp. It is interesting to note that the species that was more abundant in our samples was the undescribed species.

Habitat and diet preferences are similar for the species studied. The only exclusive habitat character was the preference of *Hippopotamyrus* for the bottom substrate of larger flowing rivers, and Decapoda as one of its principal food categories (Marrero and Winemiller, 1993). However, we found the habitat preference of this genus to extend to other genera (Kramer *et al.,* in prep.), and that *H. discorhynchus*  prefers river channels with soft bottom and fringing vegetation whereas both H. *ansorgiiand H.* sp. prefer rocky habitats in currents. In addition, *H. discorhynchus* is a nocturnal shoaling species (Skelton, 1993), and shows normal aggression for mormyrids in aquaria, whereas the other H. species are extremely intolerant of each other (A. Scheffel, personal observations). Shared morphological, behavioural and allelic characteristics (Table 6) were also useful to establish affinities.

Our results (Fig. 2, Table 3) are similar to those of Agnèse and Bigorne (1992), who studied enzyme variability at 16 presumptive loci in West African mormyrids. We also obtained one locus each for AK, CK, MEP and PGM, two loci for GPI and LDH, three for PROT, and polymorphism at AAT, GPI, MDH and PGM (Table 3). Agnèse and Bigorne (1992) report D values of  $1.07-1.99$  between *Pollimyrus* and *Petrocephalus,* 0.39-0.40 between *Pollimyrus* and *Marcusenius,*  0.06 between *Pollimyrus* and *Hippopotamyrus,* 0.63-1.35 between *Petrocephalus*  and *Marcusenius,* 0.27-0.47 between *Marcusenius* and *Hippopotamyrus,* and 0.98- 2.06 between *Petrocephalus* and *Hippopotamyrus.* These values are not congruent with our values (0.569, 0.624, 0.468-0.542, 1.412, 0.478-0.533, 0.915-1.159) for corresponding genera (Table 4). This is not unexpected since we studied more loci and different species. It is also conceivable that their limited sample size (e.g. one individual each from the genera *Hippopotamyrus* and *Pollimyrus)* contributed to produce different D values compared to our estimates. Nevertheless, we obtained similar results when a phenetic approach (Fig. 3a) was employed (i.e.

TABLE 6. a) BIOCHEMICAL, b) BEHAVIOURAL, AND c) MORPHOLOGICAL, PHYSIOLOGICAL AND ECOLOGICAL DATA TO DEFINE CLADES AND SPECIES ANALYSED: CHARACTERS 1-7 ARE SHARED AND 8-15 ARE UNIQUE FOR THE SPECIES STUDIED (FIG. 4)\*



*Pollimyrus* is closely related to the two *Hippopotamyrus* sibling species, but not H. *discorhynchus,* and these genera are closer to *Marcusenius* than to *Petrocephalus).*  Likewise, Agnèse and Bigorne (1992) found that species of *Petrocephalus* and *Marcusenius* were genetically distinct whereas species of *Hippopotamyrus* and *Pollimyrus* were closely related.

For fish, Shaklee *et al.* (1982) found that D between pairs of species from the same genus ranged from  $0.03-0.61$  (average = 0.3), and D between genera in the same family ranged between 0.58-1.21. Thorpe (1982) and Thorpe and Solé-Cava (1994) report D values of more than 0.55 for confamilial genera and less than 0.3 for conspecific populations. The D value we obtained between H. *ansorgii*  and  $H$ . sp. (0.423) is thus above average and close to the upper margin given by Shaklee *et al.* (1982) for congeneric species, and much larger than the average value (0.05) predicted for conspecific populations. This result, together with the distinct allozyme differences (Fig. 2, Table 3), clearly demonstrates the presence of a new species of *Hippopotamyrus* which we are describing (Kramer *etal.,* in prep.). From genetic distance values (Table 4), morphological differences (Table 6) and EOD waveforms (Fig. 1 ), it is also evident that H. *discorhynchus* should not be included with the other species of *Hippopotamyrus. Cyphomyrus, Marcusenius, Mormyrus* and *Petrocephalus* are genus names previously assigned to *H. discorhynchus;* in addition, there were several synonymies (Gosse, 1 984). The dorsal length of the fin is smaller, and its origin posterior to that of the anal fin in representatives from these genera, with the exception of *Cyphornyrus* (and *H. discorhynchus).* Due to this important morphological difference, and because of sufficient genetic differences (Tables 3 and 4) between the latter species and the other genera studied, we propose the reinstatement of *Cyphomyrus discorhynchus*  (Peters, 1852) as described by Myers (1960).

The cladistic trees (Figs 3b-e), in contrast to the phenetic methods, consistently clustered *P. catostoma* with *P. castelnaui,* and these relationships are reflected in the consensus tree (Fig. 3f). The grouping of these two species is congruent with morphological similarities, which previously motivated the grouping of these two species in the same genus (Jubb, 1967). Phenetic and cladistic methodologies produced different trees (Figs 3a, b-e), and the cladistic trees are more consistent with relationships between species previously established on morphological grounds. This is concordant with results obtained by other researchers who accept cladistics as the more rigorous approach to the study of phylogenetic relationships (e.g., Davis and Nixon, 1992). Figure 3f produced partial resolution of relationships, with H. *discorhynchus* and *IV~. lacerda* (branch separated: 14% majority-rule) not delineated as expected, based on morphological grounds. It is therefore essential not to adopt a single analytical method, but rather attempt to understand the biological assumptions and statistical behaviour of each method.

Figure 4 is a tree based on genetic data and morphology, and it presents a summary of relationships based on data obtained from the present study, and additional data from other sources (Table 6). The cladogram produced from morphological data (see results), is concordant with relationships shown in Fig. 3c,

REFERENCES FOR TABLE 6, OPPOSITE.

References: Bell-Cross and Minshull (1981)<sup>1</sup>; Bennett (1971a<sup>2</sup>, b<sup>3</sup>); Budgett (1901)<sup>4</sup>; Gosse (1984)<sup>5</sup>; Hopkins (1986)<sup>6</sup>; Jubb (1967)<sup>7</sup>; Kramer (1990)<sup>8</sup>; Kramer *et al.* (in prep.)<sup>9</sup>; Lévêque *et al.* (1990)<sup>10</sup>; Lissmann (1958<sup>11</sup><sup>8</sup>, 1963<sup>11b</sup>); Marrero and Winemiller (1993)<sup>12</sup>; Nelson (1984)<sup>13</sup>; Roberts (1975)<sup>14</sup>; A. Scheffel (personal observations)<sup>15</sup>; Skelton (1993)<sup>16</sup>; Somiya (1989)<sup>17</sup>; Srivastava and Szabo (1973)<sup>18</sup>; Szabo (1961<sup>19</sup>, 1967<sup>20</sup>, 1974<sup>21</sup>); Shaklee et al. (1982)<sup>22</sup>; Szabo and Fessard (1974)<sup>23</sup>; Teyssèdre and Moller (1982)<sup>24</sup>; Present study: Table 3<sup>25</sup>; Table 4<sup>26</sup>; Fig. 1<sup>27</sup>; Fig. 2<sup>28</sup>; Fig. 3<sup>29</sup>; personal observations 3°,

**except for the position of** *H. discorhynchus.* **This information, behaviour (Table 6) and relationships determined by genetic analysis (Fig. 3) was used to construct the tree in Fig. 4. The summary of shared and distinct characters (Table 6), can also be used to construct various keys (i.e., biochemical, behavioural and/or morphological) to identify members of the species studied. The results not only showed that a cryptic species is involved and that** *H. discorhynchus* **is a monophyletic genus in southern Africa, but also indicated clearly that multilocus protein electrophoresis and EOD waveform comparison could contribute significantly in understanding the affinities amongst mormyrid species. This study therefore not only reflects the evolution of the mormyrids studied, but also achieved congruence between different data sets (Fig. 4). Such consensus is desired (Shaklee and Whitt, 1981 ) to provide a truly comprehensive view of biotic evolution.** 

Acknowledgements---We are grateful for the logistical support in the field given by Manie Grobler from the Department of Agriculture and Nature Conservation of Namibia, Andy Scheffel for looking after the G. *nilo~cus,* and Dr Paul Skelton for verifying the number of pericaudal scales in type material of *H. ansorgii*  and for reading this manuscript. Bernd Kramer was supported by travel grants from the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (SFB4/H1 and Kr 446/10-1).

#### References

- Agnèse, J.-F. and Bigorne, R. (1992) Premières données sur les relations génétiques entre onze espéces ouest-africaines de Mormyddae (Teleostei, Osteichthyes). *Rev. hydrobiol, trop.* 25 (3), 253-261.
- Bell, C. C. and Szabo, T. (1986) Electroreception in mormyrid fish. Central anatomy. In: *Electroreception* (Bullock, T. H. and Heiligenberg, W., ads) pp. 375-421. John Wiley, New York.
- Bell-Cross, G. and Minshull, J. L. (1988) *The Fishes of Zimbabwe.* National Museums and Monuments of Zimbabwe, Harare. 294 pp.
- Bennett, M. V. L. (1971a) Electric organs, in: *Fish Physiology* (Hoar, W. S. and Randall, D. J., eds) pp. 347-491. Vol. V. Academic Press, London.
- Bennett, M. V. L. (1971b) Electroreception. In: *Fish Physiology* (Hoar, W. S. and Randall, D. J., eds) pp. 493-574. Vol. V. Academic Press, London.
- Budgett, **J. S. (1901 )** On the breeding-habits of some West-African fishes, with an account of the external features in development of *Protopterus annectens,* and a description of the larva of *Polypterus lapradei. Trans. Zool. Soc. Lond.* 18, 115-136.
- Cavalli-Sforza, L. L. and Edwards, A. W. F. (1967) Phylogenetic analysis: models and estimation procedures. *Evolution* 21,550-570.
- Dando, P. R. (1974) Distribution of multiple glucose phosphate isomerases in teleostean fish. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol.* 47B, 663-679.
- Davies, J. L. and Nixon, K. C. (1992) Populations, genetic variation, and the delimitation of phylogenetic species. *Syst. Biol.* 41,421-435,
- Felsenstain, J. (1993) *PHYLIP (Phylogeny Inference Package) Version 3.5.* Seattle: University of Washington.
- Fessard, A. (1958) Les organes électriques. In: *Traité de Zoologie, Anatomie, Systématique, Biologie* (Grassé, P. P., ed.) pp. 1143-1238. Vol. XIII. Masson, Paris.
- Geller, W. (1984) A toxicity warning monitor using the weakly electric fish *Gnathonemus petersii. Water Res.* 18, 1285-1290.
- Gilmore, C. (1979) The effects of ULV aerial applications of endosulfan on the feeding habits of *Schilbe mystus* and *Mormyrus lacerda* in the Okavango delta, 1977. *Botswana Notes and Records* 11, 107-114.
- Gosse, J.-P. (1984) Mormyriformes. In: *Check-list of the freshwater fishes of Africa* (Daget, J., Gosse, J.-P. and Thys van den Audenaerde, D. F. E., ads) pp. 63-124. Vol. 1. ORSTOM/MRAC, Bondy (France)/ Tervuren (Belgium).
- Graft, C. and Kramer, B. (1992) Trained weakly-electric fishes *Pollymyrus isidori* and *Gnathonernus petersii*  (Mormyridae, Teleostei) discriminate between waveforms of electric pulse discharges. *Ethology* 90, 279-292.
- Green, D. M. (1986) Systematics and evolution of western North American frogs allied to *Rana aurora* and *Rana boylii:* electrophoretic evidence. *Syst. Zool.* 35, 283-296.
- Grove, P. and Moiler, P. (1979) Electric fish as a tool for water quality assessment. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.*  108, 420-421.
- Heeg, J. and Kok, H. M. (1988) Food resource sharing and partitioning among some fishes of the Pongola River floodplain. *S. Afr. J. ZooL* 23 (4), 350-369.
- Hillis, D, M., Dull, J. J., White, M. R., Badgett, M. R. and Molineux, I. J. (1993) Experimental approaches to phylogenetic analysis. Syst. *BioL* 42, 90-92.
- Hopkins, C. D. (1986) Behaviour of mormyridae. In: *Elec~oreeeption* (Bullock, T. H. and Heiligenberg, W., eds) pp. 527-576, John Wiley, New York.
- Hopkins, C. D. (1988) Neuroethology of electric communication. *Annu. Rev. Neurosci.* 11,497-535.
- Jubb, R. A. (1967) *Freshwater Fishes of Southern Africa.* Gothic Printing Co., Cape Town. 248 pp.
- Kephart, S. R, (1990) Starch gel electrophoresis of plant isozymes: a comparative analysis of techniques. *Amer. J. Bot. 77,* 693-712.
- Kirschbaum, F. (1977) Electric organ ontogeny. Distinct larval organ precedes the adult organ in weakly electric fish. *Natutwissenschaften 64,* 387-388.
- Kramer, B. (1979) Electric and motor responses of the weakly electric fish, *Gnathonemus petersii* (Mormyridae), to play-back of social signals. *Behav. EcoL Sociobiol.* 6, 67-79.
- Kramer, B. (1990) *Electrocommunication in Teleost Fishes: Behavior and Experiments.* Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Kramer, B. (1994) Communication behaviour and sensory mechanisms in weekly electric fishes. In: Advances in the Study of Behaviour *(Slater, P. J. B., Rosenblatt, J. S., Snowdon, C. T. and Milinski, M.,* eds), 23, pp. 233-270. San Diego, CA, Academic Press.
- Kramer, B. *Electmreception and Communication in Fishes. Progress in Zoology,* vol. 42, G. Fischer Verlag, Stuttgart (in press).
- Krarner, B. and Westby, **G. W. M.** (1985) No sex difference in the waveform of the pulse-type electric fish *Gnathonemus petersii* (Mormyridae). *Experientia* 41, 1530-1531.
- Kunze, P. (1989) Verhaltensänderungen durch Atrazin bei einem elektrischen Fisch (Change of behaviour in an electric fish). Z. *Wasser-Abwasser-Forsch.* 22, 108-111.
- Kunze, P. and Wetzstein, H. U. (1988) Apomorphine and haloperidol influence electric behaviour of a mormyrid fish. *Z. Naturforsch.* 43c, 105-107.
- Lévêque, C., Paugy, D. and Teugels, G. G. (1990) Faune des poissons d'eaux douces et saumâtres de l'Afrique de l'Ouest. Vol. 1. Musée Royal de l'Afrique Centrale/Editions de l'ORSTOM, Tervuren (Belgium)/Paris (France).
- Lissmann, H. W. (1958) On the function and evolution of electric organs in fish. J. *exp. Biol.* 35, 1 56-191.
- Lissmann, H. W. (1963) Electric location by fishes. *Sci. Am.* 208, 50-59.
- Markert, C. L. and Faulhaber, I. (1965) Lactate dehydrogenase isozyme patterns of fish. J. *exp. ZooL* 159, 319-332.
- Marraro, C. and Winemiller, K. O. (1993) Tube-snouted gymnotiform and mormyriform fishes: convergence of a specialized foraging mode in teleosts. *Env. Biol. Fish.* 38, 299-309.
- Mickevich, M. F. and Johnson, M. S. (1976) Congruence between morphological and ailozyme data in evolutionary inference and character evolution. *Syst. Zool.* 25, 260-270.
- Mickevich, M. F. and Mittar, C. (1981 ) Treating polymorphic characters in systematics: a phylogenetic treatment of electrophoretic data, In: *Advances in Cladistics* (Funk, V. A. and Brooks, D. R., eds), 1, pp. 45-58. Botanical Garden, Bronx, New York.
- Mickevich, M. F. and Mitter, C. (1983) Evolutionary patterns in allozyme data: A systematic approach. In: *Advances in Cladistic¢ VoL 2, Proc. 2nd Meet. Willi Hennig Soc.* (Platnick, N. I. and Funk, V. A., eds), pp. 169-176. Columbia University Press, New York.
- Moiler, P. (1995) *Electric Fishes: History and Behaviour.* Chapman and Hall, London. 584 pp.
- Myers, G. S. (1960) The mormyrid genera *Hippopotamyrus* and *Cyphomyrus. Stanford ichthyol. Bull.* 7(4), 123-125.
- Nei, M. (1972) Genetic distance between populations. Am. *Natn.* 106, 283-292.
- Nei, M. (1978) Estimation of average heterozygosity and genetic distance from a small number of individuals. *Genetics* 89, 583-590.
- Nelson, J. S. (1984) *Fishes of the World, 2rid Edition.* John Wiley and Sons, New York. 521 pp.
- Peters, W. C. H. (1852) Diagnosen von neuen Flussfischen aus Mossambique. *Bet. Akad. Wiss. Berlin.*  **1852,** 681--685.
- Poulik, M. D. (1957) Starch gel electrophoresis in a discontinuous system of buffers. *Nature* 180, 1477- 1479.
- Postner, M. and Kramer, B. (1995) Electrosensory thresholds in larvae of the weakly electric fish *Pollimyrus isidori* (Mormyridae, Teleostei) during ontogeny. *J. Exp. Biol.* **198,** 783-791.
- Ridgway, G., Sherburne, S. W. and Lewis, R. D. (1970) Polymorphism in the esterases of Atlantic herring. *Trans. Am. Fish, Soc.* 99, 147-151.
- Roberts, T. R. (1975) Geographical distribution of African freshwater fishes. *Zool. J. Linn. Soc.* 57, 249-319.
- Rogers, J. S. (1972) Measures of genetic similarities and genetic distance. *Studies in Genetics VII University of Texas Publication* 7213, 145-153.
- Rogers, **J, S. (1986)** Deriving phylogenetic trees from allele frequencies: a comparison of nine genetic distances. *Syst. Zool.* 35, 297-310.
- Shaklee, **J. B.** and Whitt, **G. S. (1981)** Lactate dehydrogenase isozymes of gadiform fishes: divergent patterns of gene expression indicate a heterogenous taxon. *Copeia* 1981, 564-578.
- Shaklee, J. B,, Tamaru, C. S. and Waples, R. S. (1982) Speciation and evolution of marine fishes studied by electrophoretic analysis of proteins. Pac. Sci. 36, 141-157.
- Shaklee, J. B., Allendorf, F. W., Morizot, D. C. and Whitt, G. S. (1990) Gene nomenclature for proteincoding loci in fish. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* 119, 2-15.
- Skelton, P. H. (1993) *A Complete Guide to the Freshwater Fishes of Southern Africa.* Southern Book Publishers, Halfway House.
- Sneath, P. H. and Sokal, R. R. (1973) Numerical taxonomy. Freeman, San Francisco.
- Sober, E. (1993) Experimental tests of phylogenetic inference methods. *Syst. BioL* 42, 85-89.
- Somiya, H. (1989) Guanine-type retinal tapetum of three species of mormyrid fishes. *Japan. J. IchthyoL*  36, 220-226.
- Srivastava, C. B. L. and Szabo, T. (1973) Development of electric organs of *Gymnarchus niloticus* (Fam. Gymnarchidae): II. Formation of spindle. *J, MorphoL* 140, 461-466.
- Swofford, D. L. (1985) PAUP: *Phylogenetic Analysis Using Parsimony. User's Manual* Illinois Natural History Survey, Champaign, Illinois.
- Swofford, D. L. and Selander, R. B. (1981) BIOSYS-I: A FORTRAN program for the comprehensive analysis of electrophoretic data in population genetics and systematics. J. *Hered.* 72, 281-283.
- Szabo, T. (1961) Les organes électriques des mormyridés. In: *Bioelectrogenesis* (Chagas, C. and Paes de Carvalho, A., eds) pp. 20-24. Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- Szabo, T. (1967) Activity of peripheral and central neurons involved in electroreception. In: *Lateral Line Detectors* (Cahn, P., ed.) pp. 295--311. Indiana Univ. Press, Bloomington (Indiana).
- Szabo, T. (1974) Anatomy of the specialized lateral line organs of electroreception. In: *Handbook of Sensory Physiology* (Fessard, A., ed.) pp. 13-58. Vol. 111/3. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Szabo, T. and Fessard, A. (1974) Physiology of electroreceptors. In: *Handbook of Sensory Physiology*  (Fessard, A., ed.) pp. 59-124. Vol. 111/3. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Taverne, L. (1971a) Note sur la systématique des poissons Mormyriformes, le probléme des genres *Gnathonemus* Gill, *Marcusenius* Gill, *Hippopotamyrus* Pappenheim, *Cyphomyrus* Myers, et les nouveaux genres *Pollimyrus* et *Brienomyrus. Rev. ZooL Bot. Afr.* 84(1-2), 99-110.
- Taverne, L. (1971b) Ostéologie des genres *Marcusenius* Gill, *Hippopotamyrus* Pappenheim, *Cyphomyrus* Myers, *Pollimyrus* Taverne et *Brienomyrus* Taverne (Pisces, Mormyriformes). *Sci. Zool.* 118, 114pp.
- Taverne, L. (1972) Ost6ologie des genres *Mormyrus* Linn~, *Mormyrops* M011er, *Hyperopisus* G ill, *Myomyrus*  Boulenger, *Stomatorhinus* Boulenger, et *Gymnarchus* Cuvier. Considérations générales sur la systématique des poissons de l'ordre des Mormyriformes. *Sci. Zool*. **200**, 194pp.
- Teyssèdre, C. and Moller, P. (1982) The optomotor response in weak electric fish: can they see? Z. *Tierpsychol.* 60, 306-312.
- Thorpe, J. P. (1982) The molecular clock hypothesis: biochemical evolution, genetic differentiation and systematics. *Ann. Rev. Ecol. Syst.* 13, 139-168.
- Thorpe, J. P. and Solé-Cava, A. M. (1994) The use of allozyme electrophoresis in invertebrate systematics. *Zoologica Scripta* 23, 3-18.
- Van der Bank, F. H., Grobler, J. P. and Du Preez, H. H. (1992) A comparative biochemical genetic study of three populations of domesticated and wild African catfish (C/arias *gariepinus). Comp. Biochem. PhysioL*  101 B, 387-390.
- Van der Waal, B. C. W. (1985) Aspects of the biology of larger fish species of Lake Liambezi, Caprivi, South West Africa. *Madoqua* 14 (2), 101-144.
- Ward, R. D. (1977) Relationships between enzyme heterozygosity and quaternary structure. *Biochem. Gene~cs* 15, 123-135.
- Westby, G. W. M. and Kirschbaum, F. (1977) Emergence and development of the electric organ discharge in the mormyrid fish, *Pollimyrus isidori.* I The larval discharge. *J. Comp. Physiol.* A 122, 251-271.
- Westby, G. W. M. and Kirschbaum, F. (1978) Emergence and development of the electric organ discharge in the mormyrid fish, *Pollimyrus isidori.* II. Replacement of the larval by the adult discharge. *J. Comp. Physiol.* A 127, 45-59.
- Whitt, G. S. (1970) Developmental genetics of the lactate dehydrogenase isozymes of fish. *J. Exp. Zoo/.*  175, 1-35.